

United States Patent and Trademark Office

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/849,346	05/19/2004	Mohammed N. Islam	074036.0134	6695
5073 7	590 09/02/2004		EXAMINER	
BAKER BOTTS L.L.P.			SPECTOR, DAVID N	
2001 ROSS AV SUITE 600	VENUE		ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
DALLAS, TX 75201-2980			2873	

DATE MAILED: 09/02/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary		Application No. Applicant(s)					
		10/849,346 ISLAM ET AL.					
		Examiner	Art Unit	<u> </u>			
		David N. Spector	2873	pr .			
Period fo	The MAILING DATE of this communication app or Reply	pears on the cover sheet with th	e correspondence addi	ress			
THE - Exte after - If the - If NC - Failu Any	ORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION. nsions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.1 SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication. It period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period or re to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing ed patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).	36(a). In no event, however, may a reply by within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS for a cause the application to become ABANDO	e timely filed days will be considered timely. rom the mailing date of this com DNED (35 U.S.C. § 133).	imunication.			
Status							
1)🖂	Responsive to communication(s) filed on 19 May 2004.						
2a) <u></u>	·						
3)∐	-						
	closed in accordance with the practice under Ex parte Quayle, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.						
Disposit	ion of Claims						
4)⊠	4) Claim(s) 1-27 is/are pending in the application.						
	4a) Of the above claim(s) is/are withdrawn from consideration.						
′	5) Claim(s) is/are allowed.						
	☑ Claim(s) <u>1-27</u> is/are rejected.						
-	Claim(s) is/are objected to.	r alaction requirement					
الـــا(٥	Claim(s) are subject to restriction and/o	i électiou liedine meur	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·				
Applicat	ion Papers						
9)☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.							
10)⊠ The drawing(s) filed on <u>19 May 2004</u> is/are: a)⊠ accepted or b)⊡ objected to by the Examiner.							
	Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).						
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d). 11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.							
11)	The oath or declaration is objected to by the Ex	caminer. Note the attached On	ice Action of form PTC	J - 102.			
Priority (ınder 35 U.S.C. § 119						
12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f). a) All b) Some * c) None of:							
 Certified copies of the priority documents have been received. 							
2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No							
3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage							
application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)). * See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.							
See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.							
Attachmer	ut(s) ce of References Cited (PTO-892)	4) 🔲 Interview Summ	ary (PTO-413)	•			
2) Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)							
- —	mation Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08) er No(s)/Mail Date <i>0504</i> .	5)		152)			
<u>, </u>	rademark Office						

Page 2

Application/Control Number: 10/849,346

Art Unit: 2873

DETAILED ACTION

Double Patenting Rejection

- 1. The nonstatutory double patenting rejection is based on a judicially created doctrine grounded in public policy (a policy reflected in the statute) so as to prevent the unjustified or improper timewise extension of the "right to exclude" granted by a patent and to prevent possible harassment by multiple assignees. See *In re Goodman*, 11 F.3d 1046, 29 USPQ2d 2010 (Fed. Cir. 1993); *In re Longi*, 759 F.2d 887, 225 USPQ 645 (Fed. Cir. 1985); *In re Van Omum*, 686 F.2d 937, 214 USPQ 761 (CCPA 1982); *In re Vogel*, 422 F.2d 438, 164 USPQ 619 (CCPA 1970); and, *In re Thorington*, 418 F.2d 528, 163 USPQ 644 (CCPA 1969). A timely filed terminal disclaimer in compliance with 37 CFR 1.321(c) may be used to overcome an actual or provisional rejection based on a nonstatutory double patenting ground provided the conflicting application or patent is shown to be commonly owned with this application. See 37 CFR 1.130(b). Effective January 1, 1994, a registered attorney or agent of record may sign a terminal disclaimer. A terminal disclaimer signed by the assignee must fully comply with 37 CFR 3.73(b).
- 2. Claims 1-27 of the instant application are rejected under the judicially created doctrine of obviousness-type double patenting as being unpatentable over particular combinations of the claims presented collectively in U.S. Patent No. 6,407,851 (hereinafter '851), U.S. Patent No. 6,597,491 (hereinafter '491), U.S. Patent No. 6,611,366 (hereinafter '366), and U.S. Patent No. 6,654,157 ('157). Although the conflicting claims are not identical, they are not patentably distinct from each other for the following reasons.
- (a) Claims 1-6 of the instant application are drawn to a fault tolerant network with a particular combination of features/limitations recited collectively in Claims 38 and 39 of the '366 patent; taken together with Claims 1, 31, 36, and 74 of the '851 patent.
- (b) Claims 7-17 and 27 of the instant application are drawn to a optical processing device with a particular combination of features/limitations recited collectively in Claims 2-12, 14-33 of the '491 patent.
- (c) Claims 18-26 of the instant application are drawn to a method of communication [sic.] optical signals with a particular combination of features/limitations recited collectively in Claims 49-59 of the '851 patent; Claims 40-50 of the '366 patent; and Claims 9-21 and 54-73 of the '851 patent.

Page 3

Application/Control Number: 10/849,346

Art Unit: 2873

Other Remarks/Information

- 3. The information disclosure statement submitted on May 19, 2004 has been received. The patent number provided for one of the patents cited in the aforesaid IDS (e.g. U.S. Patent No. 6,597,492 B2; cite I, pg. 4/8 of said IDS) is inconsistent with the issue date, applicant's name, and other data provided on said IDS with aforesaid patent number. All of the other documents/patents included in said IDS have been considered by the examiner; accordingly, a copy of the form PTO-1449 submitted with the IDS has been initialed/signed by the examiner and enclosed with this Office action for applicant's records.
- 4. Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).
- Any other inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to David N. Spector whose telephone number is (571) 272-2338. The examiner can normally be reached at this number Monday through Friday between 6:00 AM and 2:30 PM. The fax number for the organization where this application is assigned is (703) 872-9306.

August 31, 2004

DAVID'N. SPECTOR PRIMARY EXAMINER